



Office of the
**Police & Crime
Commissioner**
West Yorkshire

Appointment of Chief Constable

West Yorkshire Police

**Report to the West Yorkshire Police and Crime Panel
on 8 February 2013**

Introduction

This is a Report written for the West Yorkshire Police and Crime Panel, following interviews held on Thursday 31st January 2013, to appoint a Chief Constable to lead the West Yorkshire Police. The author of this Report is Gi Cheesman, the independent panel member, as defined in the College of Policing Guidance on the appointment of Chief Constables. (¹)

This Report describes the process applied to the recruitment of a new Chief Constable for West Yorkshire. The recommendation for appointment is supported by sufficient evidence to allow the Police and Crime Panel to approve the proposed candidate with the confidence that the process has been appropriately comprehensive and robust.

Recommendation

It is recommended that Mark Gilmore is appointed to the post of Chief Constable: West Yorkshire Police.

The Independent Panel Member

The role of the independent member is to play a full part in the recruitment process and to ensure that the appointment is made in line with the principles of merit, fairness and openness. This role is described in the College of Policing: Guidance for the Appointment of Chief Officers.

The Report is subdivided into the following elements:

The Recruitment process:

- Role Profile and Pack
- Applications
- Shortlisting
- Interviews
- Decision making
- The Successful Candidate
- Feedback
- Due Diligence

¹ Appendix 1: Summary Biography: Gi Cheesman

Recruitment

In relation to undertaking the Chief Constable recruitment, it is important to note that the Chief Executive ⁽²⁾, as Chair of the Association of Police and Crime Chief Executives, sat on the Home Office transition working group for recruitment and selection of chief constables during 2012. Prior to initiating the process to recruit the West Yorkshire Chief Constable, he consulted with colleagues undertaking chief constable recruitment exercises around England & Wales.

Role Profile and Pack

The Role Profile was defined by the legislative framework surrounding appointments to the role of Chief Constable.

The Pack produced for applicants comprised the following:

- Letter from the Police and Crime Commissioner
- Recruitment and Selection Process Timetable (since amended)
- Chief Constable Role Profile & Terms and Conditions
- Command Team Portfolios
- Community Outcome Framework
- Application Form including Equal Opportunities Monitoring Form
- Police Professional Framework, Executive Level

Application Process

The recruitment process was undertaken in line with the requirements defined in 'Guidance for the Appointment of Chief Officers' (College of Policing: November 2012). It should be noted that the (previous) formal role of HMIC has now been removed which means that some of the traditional elements of the Chief Constable recruitment process no longer apply. As a consequence the previous senior appointments panel arrangements no longer exist.

Shortly after being elected as Police and Crime Commissioner (PCC) for West Yorkshire on 22 November 2012, the Commissioner placed an advertisement ⁽³⁾ on the OPCC website inviting expressions of interest in the vacant post of Chief Constable, West Yorkshire Police.

The Commissioner and the Chief Executive then met with HM Inspector of Constabulary (Northern Region), Roger Baker, to discuss the proposed recruitment process, the professional skills and experience that were needed in West Yorkshire, the field of likely candidates and those who had indicated their interest in the position. Following the closing date, the Commissioner and the Chief Executive had a further informal telephone conference with HMIC to consider the applications and the applicants.

The advertisement on the OPCC website resulted in 9 expressions being submitted from five Chief Constables and four Deputy Chief Constables. An application pack based on a competency framework, ⁽⁴⁾ was circulated to the 9 prospective candidates on 20 December 2012, with a closing date for the return of completed application forms by 14 January 2013.

² Appendix 2: Summary Biography: Fraser Sampson

³ Appendix 3 : Advertisement for CC

⁴ Appendix4: Application Pack Documentation

The Chief Executive spoke and/or met with 8 of the 9 prospective candidates before the closing date for applications. A number of possible candidates were able to confirm that they were simultaneously applying for other Chief Constable posts.

Two prospective candidates, who had indicated their interest in the position, had been offered positions as chief constables in other force areas before the West Yorkshire selection process was completed.

At the closing date, 5 applications were received. One from a Chief Constable and the remainder from four Deputy Chief Constables, including one individual who was in an temporary Chief Constable role.

Shortlisting

The Panel comprising the PCC (Mark Burns-Williamson), the Chief Executive and Solicitor for the Police and Crime Commissioner for West Yorkshire (Fraser Sampson) and the Independent member (Gi Cheesman) met on 21 January 2013 to consider each application and to agree a shortlist. The panel were supported by Elaine Shinkfield, Finance & Administration Manager with the OPCC.

Prior to the Shortlisting meeting each panellist had separately considered the applications and independently completed the shortlisting recording sheet associated with each applicant. Each panel member had also separately graded the competency clusters against a three point rating scale. Shortlisting packs included anonymised application forms, personal qualities checklist (Policing Professional Framework) and shortlisting recording sheets. Equalities monitoring data/information was gathered and stored separately from the application forms, to maintain the confidentiality of the process.

Each applicant was considered in relation to their responses to the specific competency clusters plus information re employment history, professional and academic qualifications and training records. These were matched against the role profile. All applicants met the criteria and all were shortlisted. Subsequently one of the applicants made contact with the Chief Executive and withdrew from the process.

The Interviews

Given the seniority of the post it was essential that the panel were able to challenge and test the candidates to ensure that their skills, experience and knowledge were of the highest order. In addition the PCC was clear in his aim to construct an inclusive and focussed recruitment & assessment process.

Questions were developed by the panel with input and support from a number of external sources including:

- Stakeholders Hate Crime Workshop
- Colleagues from the Crown Prosecution Service
- Questions sourced from children and young people during PCC visits to clubs and projects
- HMIC: Roger Baker

The process of consulting on possible questions to be included in the interviews proved very successful, in that a number of suggestions were used to good effect. This undoubtedly increased the face validity of the interviews by reflecting key issues and concerns from a range of sources.

The panel assessed the candidates as follows:

Candidates were asked to arrive an hour before their formal interview in order that they could undertake a previously unseen 45 minute preparatory exercise. They were asked to consider two questions of significant relevance to successfully undertaking the Chief Constable role, by preparing responses for the panel based on notes (as against a formal presentation) and using, at their discretion, internet or other sources to inform their response.

Following the candidates timed responses to the two questions together with subsequent follow-up/clarification, the panel asked eight further questions based on an interview recording sheet which had been previously agreed between the three panel members.

The main or opening questions had additional or supplementary questions attached to them to allow for further probing and follow up, which as far as possible were asked on a consistent basis. The 10 questions, including supplementaries, were allocated across all three panel members and this process was adhered to across all four interviews. A summary matrix, identifying where the range of Personal Qualities have been tested is attached ⁽⁵⁾. Each of the 10 questions was supported by the identification of a range of issues that candidates might be expected to include in their responses - cross referenced against the Personal Qualities matrix.

At the conclusion of each interview candidates were invited to ask the Chair (Commissioner) any questions. These were limited in relation to the number/time allowed.

The Interview Recording Sheets ⁽⁶⁾ were completed on an individual basis by each panel member including the essential element of grading candidates responses to each question against a five point assessment rating scale. ⁽⁷⁾

Decision Making

Panel members individually completed interview recording (free text) & scoring sheets but did not discuss their assessments of each Candidate until the four interviews had been completed. From the outset it was agreed that the quality of the candidates was of a high standard: all were assessed to be 'above the line' and therefore appointable.

The decision making process was robust:

- The application of the Scoring Matrix, using the five point scale, allowed for a full picture of raw scores (prior to any moderation) against all the Personal Qualities categories. A full scrutiny of these prompted a significant amount of discussion on an individual candidate basis. Comparisons of the scores were also made to assess relativities between the scores in specific areas as well as across each interview as a whole.
- There was full and open discussion amongst the Panel of each candidate based on an overall view of their performance at interview and those specific areas where particular strengths and weaknesses were in evidence. At all times the focus was on the competencies and qualities needed to perform successfully in the Chief Constable role.

⁵ Appendix 5: Personal Qualities Summary Matrix

⁶ Appendix 6: Example of an Interview Recording Sheet

⁷ Appendix 7: The 5 point Assessment Rating Scale

As the process of decision making progressed, there was a clear hierarchy of scores/performance apparent. Helpfully the inter-rater reliability was high across the Panel, demonstrating a high degree of consensus. As a result a minimal degree of moderation was needed in order to reach the final scores. There was a unanimous view of the successful candidate and the PCC made the decision to offer the post to Mark Gilmore.

The Successful Candidate

Mark Gilmore ⁽⁸⁾ has been offered the post of Chief Constable of West Yorkshire subject to ratification by the Police and Crime Panel.

He was selected on the strength of his application (evidence of experience, knowledge and skills) and interview. The decision incorporated the following evidence:

- His presentation in relation to the first two questions (pre prepared by him before the interview) was clear and articulate in style, covering a wide range of issues including leadership and vision, working closely with the PCC 'leading together' and highlighting a strong focus on performance and delivery.
- His performance at interview reinforced the fact that he has strong strategic capability and experience (Leading Strategic Change) and that his ability to undertake and lead significant change processes is demonstrated by his track record.
- Mark scored just below the maximum total achievable against the Professionalism competency cluster. This indicates that Mark has a high degree of integrity and is driven by the values and ethical standards of the Police Service. During the interview he consistently demonstrated an ability to think widely and to engage in a very open and straightforward way.
- His strong scores across the 'Working with others' cluster indicates his abilities to develop and maintain effective collaborative relationships, to work with people to ensure equality and to consult and negotiate effectively. During his interview many of these qualities, including an articulate and open style convinced the panel that Mark would work well with the PCC, with the public and with all those working in a range of roles across the Service
- Given the national and local Policing challenges over the next years it was recognised that the new Chief Constable must have strengths in relation to leading the workforce, in respect of Decision Making and in relation to Performance Management...which also demands a highly strategic approach. Mark was able to score highly against these key competencies including budgetary/financial management.
- Finally he was able to demonstrate a very strong capability in respect of leading and delivering in line with the essential 'Public Service' criteria. His scores in relation to partnership and community engagement and building public confidence were consistently extremely high.

The Panel, and particularly the PCC, were delighted to be able to interview and subsequently offer the role to such a convincing candidate. As mentioned previously, the other three candidates also performed strongly with a number achieving high scores and confirming their extensive and impressive range of skills and experience. It is good to see such talent within the very senior ranks of the Police Service.

⁸ Appendix 8: Mark Gilmore: Summary Biography

Feedback on the process

During the selection process, every effort was made to ensure that candidates were responded to quickly and that they were treated with courtesy and consideration. This extended to their attendance for interview when informal feedback was encouraged in relation to their perceptions of the recruitment process as a whole. Feedback so far has been positive.

Due Diligence:

At an early stage, on receipt of applications, all were checked to confirm that applicants:

- Had been a constable within the UK (Schedule 8 to the Police Reform and Social Responsibility Act 2011)
- Had satisfactorily completed the Senior Police National Assessment Centre and the Strategic Command Course (Part 1, Annex B of the Secretary of State's determinations made under Regulation 11 of the Police Regulations 2003). Also in line with requirements as defined under regulations under Section 50 of the Police Act 1996

Plus:

- The Appointment has been made in compliance with the Equality Act 2010
- The Appointment made in compliance with the Data Protection Act 1998.

In summary, as the Independent Member of the Appointments Panel, I am pleased to confirm that the process of Recruitment and Selection has adhered to the high standards that the Police and Crime Panel, the West Yorkshire Police Service and public/partners, represented through a vast range of communities, have a right to expect in respect of the appointment of a new Chief Constable. The recommendation that Mark Gilmore is appointed is at the top of the Report.

Gi Cheesman
February 1st 2013

Appendix 1: Gi Cheesman: Biography

- Gi Cheesman and her family are citizens of West Yorkshire. Professionally Gi is a management consultant who for 6 years has operated as an OCPA accredited Independent Panellist/Assessor. She was recently appointed as an External Panel Member and continues to work with a number of NHS and Central Government organisations in that capacity
- Much of her work has been undertaken for the Appointments Commission, involving appointing Non-Executive Directors to Public Sector Boards. For over 3 years she was the Independent Assessor for the West Yorkshire Police Authority
- Gi is a Lay Panellist on the Nursing and Midwifery Council where she sits on cases that require triage or judgements regarding suspension from practice.
- She is also an interim manager specialising in HR/Development and Change at Director level in the NHS and Local Authority sectors. Previously she was an Executive Director of Sheffield Health Authority and a senior civil servant in the Department of Health.
- Gi has a BA Hons in Management, is a qualified and experienced teacher (Oxford) and has an MBA from Leeds University.

Appendix 2: Fraser Sampson: Summary Biography

- Fraser Sampson is the Chief Executive and Solicitor of the Office of the Police and Crime Commissioner, West Yorkshire having held the role in the context of the West Yorkshire Police, since June 2008.
- He has previously held posts as Executive Director Civil Nuclear Police Authority and Head of Police Law Unit, Walker Morris, Solicitors in Leeds. For five years previously he was Head of National Police Examinations & Assessment Department, Home Office
- Fraser has held a range of professional positions including membership of the Joint Counter-Terrorism Oversight Board, Chair of the Association of Police Authority Chief Executives (current) and as an Advisor to the Association of Police Authorities Board.
- He has a range of publications and specifically has published papers in relation to recruitment and selection. Fraser has two law degrees and in 2002 was appointed as Solicitor of the Supreme Court. He has an Executive MBA (Leeds University) and is a Visiting Research Fellow at the University of Leeds Law School.
- In 2010 Fraser was a Weinstein International Mediation Fellow, JAMS Foundation, San Francisco.

Appendix 3: Advertisement for Chief Constable

CHIEF CONSTABLE, West Yorkshire Police

Salary: £169,359



Office of the
**Police & Crime
Commissioner**
West Yorkshire



As the newly elected Police and Crime Commissioner for West Yorkshire, I am searching for a talented and passionate senior police officer who shares my vision for policing the County.

The successful candidate must be able to take on the challenge of leading the fourth largest police force in England and Wales and inspire over 9,000 police officers and support staff to maintain the region's falling crime figures.

The ideal candidate will be able to:

- Balance swift and strong action with building strong relationships across diverse urban and rural communities
- Gain the trust and confidence of the 2.2 million people in West Yorkshire
- Work effectively with our trusted partners in the fight against crime
- Deliver improved front-line services against a background of diminishing resources

I have pledged to tackle anti-social behavior, be tough on the causes of crime and ensure the police maintain their operational independence. My other priorities include supporting victims and tackling hate crime in all its forms.

If you share my vision and have the necessary skills to police this vibrant and welcoming county, I look forward to hearing from you.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'M. B. Williamson'.

Mark Burns-Williamson

Police and Crime Commissioner for West Yorkshire

Expressions of interest are invited from suitably qualified candidates who have completed the Strategic Command Course by contacting Fraser Sampson, Chief Executive and Solicitor on 01924 294002 or email cx@westyorkshire-pcc.gov.uk

Appendix 4: Application Pack Documentation



CHIEF CONSTABLE APPLICATION PACK

CONTENTS

- ✓ Letter from the Police and Crime Commissioner
- ✓ A copy of the advertisement
- ✓ Recruitment and Selection Process Timetable
- ✓ Chief Constable Role Profile and Terms and Conditions
- ✓ Command Team Portfolios
- ✓ Community Outcome Framework
- ✓ Application Form (including Equal Opportunities Monitoring Form)
- ✓ Police Professional Framework, Executive Level – Personal Qualities

Appendix 5: Personal Qualities Summary Matrix

Personal Qualities	Application Form	Interview Question No's	Tested
Public Service	√	2/5/6/9	5
Leading Strategic Change	√	2/6/7/10	5
Leading the Workforce	√	1/3/4/8/9	6
Managing Performance	√	1/3/4/8	5
Professionalism	√	4/8/9/10	5
Decision Making	√	5/6/7	4
Working with Others	√	1/2/3/5/7/10	7

Appendix 6: Example of an Interview Recording Sheet

<p align="center">Preparation Question 2 (Mark)</p> <p>How can you rebalance the relationship between young people and the police in West Yorkshire?</p> <p>Supplementary (Fraser) We asked groups of young people in West Yorkshire what questions they would like to ask you as a candidate to be their next Chief Constable. What do you think were the key issues they raised?</p> <p>Is the candidate interested in knowing what they said?</p> <p>Looking for.....</p> <p>Feeling safe – high degree of consistency from young people who want to feel safe in homes/community</p> <p>Relationship – how they are viewed by the police, stereotyping, should begin relationship at an early age</p> <p>Ability of individual police officers to have very powerful effect + or – on young people</p> <p>Understand impact of crime on young people - Fear of crime and being a victim: articulate how the young BME population may have constructed different views re the police</p> <p>Trust in the new CC from teenagers – most wanted to be able to trust the new CC and felt this required more effort on the part of the CC</p>			<p align="center">Public service</p> <p>Promotes a real belief in public service, focusing on what matters to the public and will best serve their interests. Ensures that all staff understand the expectations, changing needs and concerns of different communities, and strive to address them. Builds public confidence by actively engaging with different communities, agencies and strategic stakeholders, developing effective partnerships at a local and national level. Understands partners' perspectives and priorities, working co-operatively with them to develop future public services within budget constraints, and deliver the best possible overall service to the public.</p> <p align="center">Leading strategic change</p> <p>Thinks in the long term, establishing a compelling vision based on the values of the Police Service, and a clear direction for the force. Instigates and delivers structural and cultural change, thinking beyond the constraints of current ways of working, and is prepared to make radical change when required. Identifies better ways to deliver value for money services that meet both local and national needs, encouraging creativity and innovation within the force and partner organisations.</p> <p align="center">Working with others</p> <p>Builds effective working relationships through clear communication and a collaborative approach. Maintains visibility and ensures communication processes work effectively throughout the force and with external bodies. Consults widely and involves people in decision-making, speaking in a way they understand and can engage with. Treats people with respect and dignity regardless of their background or circumstances, promoting equality and the elimination of discrimination. Treats people as individuals, showing tact, empathy and compassion. Negotiates effectively with local and national bodies, representing the interests of the Police Service. Sells ideas convincingly, setting out benefits of a particular approach, and striving to reach mutually beneficial solutions. Expresses own views positively and constructively. Fully commits to team decisions.</p>		
Public service	Possible: 5	Actual:	Leading strategic change	Possible: 5	Actual:
Working with others	Possible: 5	Actual:			

Appendix 7: The 5 Point Assessment Rating Scale

FIVE POINT ASSESSMENT RATING SCALE

Rating	Definition
5. Exceptional	The candidate has provided evidence that directly relates to the quality/competency area being measured. This evidence clearly explains their role and what they did in relation to many of the behavioural descriptors associated with the competency area. The example/ examples used have direct relevance to the organisational objectives and the areas of importance as defined by the PCC relating to this role.
4. Very High	The candidate has provided evidence that directly relates to the quality/competency area being measured. This evidence clearly explains their role and what they did in relation to many of the behavioural descriptors associated with the area. The example/ examples used have some relevant links to the organisational objectives and the areas of importance as defined by the PCC relating to this role.
3. High	The candidate has provided evidence that relates to some of the quality/competency area being measured. In the main the evidence explains their role and what they did in relation to some of the behavioural descriptors associated with the area. The example/ examples used have some relevant links to the organisational objectives and the areas of importance as defined by the PCC relating to this role.
2. Medium	The candidate has provided some evidence that relates to some of the quality/competency area being measured. In the main the evidence clearly explains their role and what they did in relation to some of the behavioural descriptors associated with the area. The example/examples used have some links indirectly to the organisational objectives and the areas of importance as defined by the PCC relating to this role.
1. Low	The candidate has provided some evidence that relates to the competency area being measured. This evidence does not clearly explain their role and what they did in relation to the behavioural descriptors associated with the area. The example/ examples used have no direct relevance to the organisational objectives and the areas of importance as defined by the PCC relating to this role.

Appendix 8: Mark Gilmore: Summary Biography

From 31/08/2011-Current: Deputy Chief Constable: Northumbria Police

Responsibilities cover:

- Force Performance
- Programme of Change
- Professional Standards
- Force Legal Services
- Corporate Communications
- Strategy & Planning Unit
- Collaboration

From 01/06/2009-30/08/2011: Assistant Chief Constable: West Yorkshire Police

Responsibilities covered the Special Operations Portfolio including:

- Operations Support Department
- Communications Department
- Scientific Support
- Force Training and Development

From 01/02/2008-31/05/2009: Chief of Staff to the ACPO President: On secondment from the Police Service of Northern Ireland

Lead ACPO roles include (or until recently)

- Public Order Lead for Protest and Disorder
- Forensic Science Lead for Science and Innovation
- Interoperability Lead

Qualifications include:

- University of Ulster: PG Dip in Admin and Legal Studies
- University of Ulster: MA in Administrative & Legal Studies
- Harvard University MA, USA: International Senior Exec Programme: Graduation Cert

Training Programmes include:

- NPIA Assessor Course: Strategic Command Course
- NPIA Firearms Gold Command: Strategic Gold Firearms Command
- ACPO TAM: CT Commanders Course

Equality, Diversity & Human Rights include:

- Stonewall Diversity Engagement
- NI Peace & Community Building conflict resolution: Columbia University, New York
- Diversity for Strategic Leaders